



The General Manager  
Hornsby Shire Council

**DA/985/2020 - 99 Copeland Road, BEECROFT NSW 2119 - SUBDIVISION OF TWO LOTS INTO FOUR AND ERECTION OF A DWELLING ON ONE NEW LOT**

Dear Sir,

The Beecroft Civic Trust strongly objects to the proposed subdivision and demolition of Strathallan on the following grounds.

The heritage report is considered inadequate as it does not fully assess the heritage of the dwelling known as Strathallan, nor of its gardens and related curtilage.

The Trust believes the heritage report is structured to achieve a preconceived conclusion that recommends demolition. The report focuses only on the past alterations to the dwelling and argues that with these alterations the dwelling is not worth retaining. The report fails to adequately explain why the additions are intrusive and fails to explore how Strathallan could be saved and past intrusive alterations removed. The Trust understands Strathallan is in good condition and still retains many of its key contributory features. The report fails to adequately comment on the current integrity of the dwelling or its existing heritage qualities. The heritage report only offers a compromise by supporting the retention of the stone fence facing Copeland Rd.

Simply, the heritage is considered to be disappointing and inadequate.

The Trust argues that the subject dwelling Strathallan clearly makes a significant contribution to the Beecroft Cheltenham Heritage Conservation Area (BCHCA). Even more so now that its sister dwelling Rowallan was demolished when the adjoining lands at 101 Copeland Rd was subdivided. While Strathallan is currently visually hidden from the street by the existing vegetation, the dwelling, if retained, will no doubt become visible if any development occurs on the subject site. Therefore the Trust argues that Strathallan was and is still an important contributory item to the HCA streetscape.

The Trust requests that the submitted heritage report be either rewritten or a peer review be carried out. The Trust believes Council cannot proceed with any demolition of Strathallan based on the submitted heritage report. In fact, after the loss of Rowallan, it may be prudent that this matter is referred to Council's heritage Advisory Committee for comment.

The subdivision layout is considered poor and therefore unacceptable. The Trust regards the proposed dwelling on Lot 11 as part of stage one as a strategy to overcome any heritage constraints over the total site. The extensive setback of the proposed dwelling on Lot 11 is noted but in so doing creates an amenity issue at the rear of the proposed dwelling.

The Trust notes that the rear two Lots 13 and 14 just comply with the minimum lot size of 600 sqm. However lot 14 has a poor shape that will create poor amenity in the future when development occurs on all four lots.

The Trust wants Strathallan retained, together with the important elements of its curtilage. Beecroft and Cheltenham has lost too much heritage over the past 30 years. But, the Trust also notes that the front curtilage exists as a separate lot that can be legally developed.

Perhaps a compromise may be available, being a 3 lot subdivision with lot 13 at the rear deleted, Lot 11 adjusted at the front, Strathallan retained on a larger Lot 12, and Lot 14 reconfigured to minimise impact on Strathallan's curtilage. Of course consideration should be given to the removal of unsympathetic additions to Strathallan to assist the subdivision layout. Lot 14 will have a compromised shape but that can be justified on heritage grounds with the retention of Strathallan. A 3 lot subdivision will provide a curtilage around the heritage dwelling but also provide a more appropriate setback at the rear of the proposed dwelling in the front Lot 11. The proposed dwelling on Lot 11 could also be reduced in height or even lowered into the slope so Strathallan can be viewed from the street. Appropriate vegetation planting and retention of the numerous exotic vegetation will assist creating a visual screen between the Strathallan and the dwelling in front on Lot 11. And again there will be justification for varying the DCP controls for the dwelling on Lot 11.

In summary, the Trust strongly objects to the proposed four lot subdivision and demolition of Strathallan. However the Trust recognises that the subject site contains two legal lots. Therefore the Trust is seeking a more sympathetic redevelopment that can retain the site's important heritage elements as outlined in the BCHCA and at the same time be consistent with the objectives of the HELP.

Yours Sincerely

Ross Walker OAM  
President  
Beecroft Cheltenham Civic Trust

1 December 2020